

THE BAIS HAVAAD

HALACHA JOURNAL

Family, Business, and Jewish Life through the Prism of Halacha

VOLUME 5782 · ISSUE XVI · PARSHAS BESHALACH · SHABBOS SHIRAH



EXTINGUISHING ON SHABBOS: THE SHIFTING STATUS OF HOUSE FIRES

Adapted from the writings of Dayan Yitzhak Grossman

The New York Post reports:

At least 19 people were killed—including nine children—when the city's deadliest fire in more than 30 years tore through a Bronx apartment high-rise Sunday morning.

Choking, blinding smoke trapped many of the victims of the five-alarm blaze, which was blamed on a malfunctioning space heater turned on to help ward off the cold temps outside, authorities said.¹

In this two-part series, we survey the

evolution of halachic assumptions (in response to changing social conditions and other factors) regarding the level of danger posed by house fires. The first part will discuss the perspectives of the Gemara and the Rishonim, and the second, those of earlier as well as contemporary *Acharonim*.

Note that these articles are intended as a general survey of the halachic literature on the topic; for practical guidance, a qualified *rav* should be consulted. As we shall see, the Gemara and the early *poskim*, and even some contemporary *poskim*, assume that house fires do not always, or even generally, pose a danger to life. This assumption is

(continued on page 2)

¹ Tina Moore, Ben Kessler, Steven Vago, C.J. Sullivan, Larry Celona and Reuven Fenton, Horrific Bronx fire leaves at least 19 dead, dozens more critically injured. <https://nypost.com/2022/01/09/nyc-fire-leaves-numerous-people-injured/>.

A PUBLICATION OF THE
BAIS HAVAAD HALACHA CENTER
105 River Ave. #301, Lakewood NJ 08701
1.888.485.VAAD (8223)
www.baishavaad.org
info@baishavaad.org
Lakewood • Midwest • Brooklyn • South Florida

לע"נ הרב יוסף ישראל
ב"ר משה גרוסמן זצ"ל

Dedicated in loving memory of
HaRav Yosef Grossman zt"l



PARSHAS BESHALACH

INNER SPACE

Excerpted and adapted from a shiur by
HaRav Chaim Weg

Then Moshe and B'nei Yisrael sang
this song...

Shmos 15:1

Az Yashir is called a *shirah* (song). It must be written like brickwork ("*ariach al gabei leveinah*"), in which the lines alternate between having 1) a large space in the center and 2) two large spaces, one left of center and one right of center. According to the Shulchan Aruch (Y.D. 275, from Shabbos 103b), if a *shirah* is written without the extra spaces, or if the rest of a sefer Torah is written in the form of a *shirah*, the sefer Torah is invalid.

The Shulchan Aruch says it is customary to write Az Yashir in thirty lines. The first line is written normally, then the next twenty-nine alternate as above.

It appears that the difference between a *shirah* and the regular sections of the sefer Torah involves two halachos.

(continued on page 2)

Storepost

Q Do I need to put up mezuzos in my store?

A The Shulchan Aruch (Y.D. 286:11) exempts stores in marketplaces from mezuzos. Many *Acharonim* explain that this refers to temporary shops. Permanent ones, however, because they are occupied for much of the time and are used to store the owner's merchandise, are dwellings and require mezuzos

(continued on page 2)

Q&A from the
BAIS HAVAAD
HALACHA HOTLINE
1.888.485.VAAD(8223)
ask@baishavaad.org

(continued from page 1)

obviously based on considerations such as the details of home construction, size, and density, and the nonflammability of the building materials and contents of homes, typical of their societies. Modern home construction and furnishing are very different from those of earlier eras, and accordingly, some more recent *poskim* do indeed rule that today, house fires are generally considered a matter of life and death, as we shall see.

THE GEMARA

The sixteenth *perek* of Maseches Shabbos (Kol Kisvei) deals primarily with the laws of Shabbos pertaining to house fires: preventing them, containing their spread, extinguishing them, and rescuing property from being consumed by them. The premise that underlies the entire discussion is that such fires generally present no danger to human life, and accordingly only certain limited dispensations from the normal restrictions of Shabbos are granted.

THE RISHONIM

Various *Rishonim* of Ashkenaz ruled that in their era, house fires entailed mortal danger and so could be extinguished on Shabbos. This was not due to any increase in the inherent danger of fires from the Gemara's era to theirs, but rather to particular social concerns prevalent in their time.

The Or Zarua rules:

It is permitted to extinguish a fire in contemporary times, because there are those who live among the nations, and when there is a fire, they come and loot and kill (i.e., and when people will attempt to defend their property, the

looters may kill them²), and the situation is not less exigent than that of a city near the border (where desecration of Shabbos is permitted in order to counter the threat of raiders, even if the raiders' target is...not human beings.)³

The Trumas Hadeshen rules:

Even in a situation of (merely) possible danger (*safeik sakanah*), *gedolei* Yisrael may extinguish a fire, even though it is possible to have a gentile extinguish it...

In a case of fire, where there is danger that the blood of "the enemies of the Jews" (a euphemism for the Jews themselves) will come to be spilled, one should not instruct a gentile to extinguish [the fire], but it is a mitzvah to extinguish it oneself.

And one of the *gedolim* publicly expounded that it is permitted to extinguish a fire on Shabbos in contemporary times, and he said that he is expounding this in public in order that he not be considered negligent in a matter of life and death...

Some limited the dispensation to extinguish the fire to where it started in a Jewish house, because

The law of the gentiles is that when they find the one from whose house the fires started, they cast him into the fire...so there is danger to the rest of the Jews as well, since [the gentiles] are accustomed to say, "All Jews are responsible for each other."

But the Trumas Hadeshen rejects this, arguing that as per the language of the Or Zarua, we are concerned for homicidal

2 Shulchan Aruch HaRav O.C. siman 334 se'if 28; Kaf Hachaim ibid. s.k. 128; Mishnah Brurah siman 334 s.k. 72. The Trumas Hadeshen (cited below) explains that "via the seizing of property they come to killing." As cited below, the Knesses Hagedolah also mentions the concern that property owners will be unable to restrain themselves from defending their property and will consequently be killed by the looters, but he states this on his own account rather than as an interpretation of the Or Zarua.

3 Hagahos Ashri Eiruvim perek 4 siman 6, citing Or Zarua.

is such a space within the parshah of the *shirah* but not in the *shirah* itself,¹ it may not invalidate the sefer Torah, because spaces do not invalidate a *shirah*.

1 A possible example is the section after Az Yashir beginning with the words "Ki va sus Paroh," which follows the *shirah* but is still in the parshah of Az Yashir (see Machatzis Hashekel O.C. 51).

O&A from the
BAIS HAVAAD
HALACHA HOTLINE
1.888.485.VAAD(8223)
ask@baishavaad.org

(continued from page 1)

(Pis'chei Teshuvah 286:10, Kitzur Shulehan Aruch 11:14, and R' Akiva Eiger 286:11).

The Taz (286:10) disagrees and says even permanent stores are exempt, unless they are occupied by the owner both day and night.

(He would likely agree that an actual home that is not occupied day and night still requires a mezuzah.)

Many *Acharonim* adopt his view (Chayei Adam 15:11 and Derech Hachayim). Sefer Agurah Be'ahalecha writes that this view would exempt even stores that are open 24/6, because the owner isn't there day and night. Given the controversy, contemporary *poskim* advise placing mezuzos in stores but without a *bracha*.

Dressing rooms are exempt, because they are occupied only briefly and aren't used for storage. And only entry doors require mezuzos, so those used just for exiting are exempt.

There is debate whether a shop open for only one season each year is temporary enough to be exempt according to all, but if merchandise is stored there year-round, it would require a mezuzah according to the first view above.



DAYAN YEHOSHUA GRUNWALD

looters, not (merely) with "legal" reprisals for the fire. He concludes:

But it appears that we should consider the particular circumstances, according to the opinion of the scholars of the city, e.g., if there are judges and rulers in the city who promise to save the Jews. In such a case, if it appears that there is no danger whatsoever, then they should not desecrate Shabbos at all...⁴

4 Trumas Hadeshen cheilek 1 siman 58. These rulings are codified by the Rama in Shulchan Aruch O.C. 334:26.

(continued from page 1)



The first is that *shirah* requires the large spaces, and the second is that those spaces do not render it invalid as they would in other parts of the Torah. If so, it would seem that if there

Scan here to receive the weekly email version of the Halacha Journal or sign up at www.baishavaad.org/subscribe

Elevate your inbox.



SILVER
FAMILY
THERAPY
AGENCY
Care

BHHJ SPONSORS
Mr. Shmuel Caro

To become a corporate sponsor of the BHHJ or disseminate in memory/zechus of a loved one, email info@baishavaad.org