

Rav Yosef Greenwald

Shulchan Aruch (O.C. 671:7):

- The *minhag* is to light Chanukah candles in shul with a *beracha* just like at home.

The problem:

- The Gemara states (*Shabbos* 21b) that the obligation is “*Ner Ish Uveiso*” (one candle for each household). How is the shul considered one’s house?
- How can we recite a *beracha* on a *minhag*, to which the word “*v’tzivanu*” is entirely inapplicable?
 - o Even the *Mishna Berura*’s suggestion (671:44) of a precedent from the custom of reciting Hallel on Rosh Chodesh with a *beracha* is difficult, since the *Shulchan Aruch* and the Gra say not to make a *beracha* there.

Chidushei HaGriz (on the Rambam):

- There are two types of *minhagim*:
 - o New creations not based directly on any previous mitzvah, such as beating *aravos* on Hoshana Rabba, which the Gemara (*Sukka* 44a) says is a *minhag neviim*.
 - o *Minhagim* that are direct extensions of already existing mitzvos, such as eating matza and *marror* at a second Seder outside of Israel, which the Gemara (*Beitza* 4b) says is based on *minhag (minhag avoseihem byedeihem)*.

- On the first type of *minhag*, no *beracha* is recited, as we cannot say *v’tzivanu* on an action that wasn’t actually commanded. But the second type of *minhag* does warrant a *beracha*, as the original mitzvah was commanded, and the *minhag* is an extension of the original mitzvah.

- Both reciting Hallel on Rosh Chodesh and lighting Chanukah candles in shul are in the second category, since they are an extension of the original mitzvos of reciting Hallel on the other *mo'adim* and lighting Chanukah candles at home, respectively.

- Based on this logic, a *beracha* is recited on both.