

First Light

Excerpted and adapted from a *shiur* by Rav Avraham Yeshaya Cohen

December 15, 2022

https://baishavaad.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/BER82_009_Vayeishev_Man_Made_Animals_Artificially_Created_Animals_in_Halacha.mp3

The Gemara (Shabbos 21b) says to light Chanukah candles *mishetishka hachamah*.^[1] If one did not do so, he may light *ad shetichleh regel min hashuk* (until there are no more passersby outside).

Tosafos cites the view of the Ri Poras that one should ideally light immediately at the start of the *zman*, but if he delayed, he may still light *ad shetichleh*. Tosafos then cites the Ri, who argues that today, when lighting is done inside and only the household sees the candles, one need not light by that time.

The Rama (672:2) rules like the Ri that one may light inside even after *ad shetichleh*. But he concludes that it is best to be careful to light within the *zman* even today. Some explain that we should not change Chazal's time, even if their reason no longer applies. Others suggest that if one waits, his household members may disperse or they may wish to eat a meal, which is forbidden before lighting. The Gra (Ma'asei Rav) takes the extreme position that if one lights after the *zman*, he may not even make a *bracha*.

Presumably, such a *chiddush* can only be made if one assumes that the reason for lighting on time is due to the *takanas* Chazal and is unrelated to the passersby.

Should yeshiva *bachurim* light at the *zman*, or should they complete their learning seder? The Me'iri writes that yeshiva students in France, because they lit indoors, finished their learning first. Presumably, the reasons given to light early even inside are overridden by the consideration of talmud Torah. On the other hand, if one holds like the Gra, he may not fulfill the mitzvah properly when lighting after the *zman*, so he should interrupt his learning to light.

[1] Some maintain that this is *shkiah* (sunset), others that it is *tzeis hakochavim* (nightfall).